

Evaluating the Effectiveness of Police Reforms in Enhancing National Security in Kenya

By

Roba Dabassa Mudale & Dr. Caroline Wandiri Mwea, PhD

Department of Security, Diplomacy and Peace Studies, Kenyatta University, Kenya

Corresponding author email: robamudale@gmail.com

Abstract

National security has evolved to encompass not just military threats but also societal issues impacting public safety. Police play a crucial role in maintaining order, but recent years have seen calls for reform due to concerns about use of force and racial bias. The study investigated the relationship between police reform and national security in Kenya, through an evaluation of the effectiveness of specific reforms like community policing, body-worn cameras, de-escalation training, civilian review boards, and banning no-knock warrants. The study acknowledged the challenges of implementation, including resource constraints, institutional resistance, community skepticism, political influence, and the uncritical adoption of foreign models. Measuring the success of reforms on national security presents difficulties. Defining national security is complex, and attributing change to specific reforms is challenging due to concurrent social and economic factors. The study employed a longitudinal case study design to examine the impacts of police reforms in Kenya. Data collection involved a mixed methods approach, utilizing quantitative data on crime statistics through surveys and qualitative data through interviews, focus groups and document analysis. The analysis revealed positive outcomes from reforms, including improved community relations, strengthened accountability, and technological advancements in policing. However, challenges like incomplete implementation, public skepticism, and external socioeconomic factors limit the full realization of these reforms. The study emphasizes the need for sustained commitment, fostering public trust, and addressing root causes of crime to ensure a safer and more just Kenya.

Key Words: Kenya, Accountability, Community Policing, Technology, Training and Education & Use of Force

Evaluating the Effectiveness of Police Reforms in Enhancing National Security in Kenya

By

Roba Dabassa Mudale & Dr. Caroline Wandiri Mwea, PhD

Introduction

National security, a cornerstone concept for nations, refers to the protection and preservation of a country's core interests against threats (McGranahan, 2020). These interests encompass territorial integrity, citizen well-being, and the political and economic stability of the nation according to the Council on Foreign Relations (2022). Traditionally, national security concerns focused on military threats from nation-states. However, the landscape has become increasingly complex in the 21st century (Chen, 2021). The rise of non-state actors like terrorist organizations and cybercriminals pose significant challenges. Additionally, transnational issues like pandemics, climate change, and resource scarcity necessitate a broader understanding of national security. To effectively address these evolving threats, nations require a multi-faceted approach that encompasses military preparedness, diplomacy, economic security, and robust intelligence gathering (McGranahan, 2020). Striking a balance between national security measures and individual liberties remains an ongoing challenge for governments (Council on Foreign Relations, 2022). As the world continues to transform, understanding the multifaceted nature of national security and its impact on individuals and societies is crucial.

In the arena of national security, police play a vital role in upholding public safety and maintaining social order. However, the past two decades have witnessed a surge in public scrutiny of police practices, particularly concerning use of force and racial bias (White & Fraga, 2023). This has ignited a national conversation on police reform, aimed at creating a more effective and equitable system. The reform agenda encompasses a wide range of initiatives. Some focus on de-escalation tactics and implicit bias training to reduce unnecessary force and improve interactions with minority communities. Others explore alternative responses to mental health calls and community-oriented policing programs to foster trust and legitimacy (Wood *et al.*, 2021). Technological advancements also play a part, with reforms considering body cameras and data-driven approaches to improve transparency and accountability (Maguire & Nix, 2022).

Assumptions

Implementing police reforms leads to a positive impact on national security.

Statement of Problem

Kenya has embarked on a journey of police reform since 2003, aiming to bolster national security. Efforts have focused on improving officer training in areas like human rights and modern investigative techniques. Additionally, increasing police numbers, upgrading infrastructure, and providing better equipment aimed to enhance police presence and response

times. Building trust with the public is another key goal, achieved through community policing programs and improved complaint mechanisms. These reforms have shown early signs of success, with increased police visibility in some areas and improved communication due to technology upgrades. Irrespective of the undertakings, challenges remain. Full implementation is slow due to funding and logistical issues. Public perception of police brutality and corruption persists, hindering trust. Additionally, inadequate officer welfare can affect morale and performance. Moving forward, continued focus on training, resource allocation, and community engagement is crucial. Addressing corruption and brutality is essential to rebuild public trust. Effective reforms can lead to a more professional and accountable police force, ultimately enhancing national security in Kenya.

Objective

To evaluate the effectiveness of police reforms in enhancing national security in the context of specific reforms on police practices, public perception, and the challenges of implementation, while considering measures in the success of reforms on security outcomes.

Review of Related Literature

Impact of Specific Reforms on Police Practices and Public Perception

Police reform efforts aim to improve police practices and public perception. Community policing, a reform strategy in law enforcement, emphasizes increased community engagement through methods like foot patrols, community meetings, and problem-solving initiatives. A study by Mastrobuoni & Hess (2020), indicate that community policing can enhance trust and cooperation between police and the public. However, its effectiveness hinges on authentic community involvement and addressing the root causes of social issues, as highlighted by Zhao *et al.* (2018). This approach fosters a collaborative effort between law enforcement and community members, aiming for proactive crime prevention and sustainable solutions to community problems.

Body-Worn Cameras (BWCs) have emerged as a reform measure in law enforcement by outfitting officers with devices to record their interactions. A study by White *et al.* (2019), indicate that BWCs can serve as a deterrent to excessive force and enhance officer accountability. Nevertheless, challenges persist regarding data storage, privacy issues, and the limited efficacy of BWCs in addressing racial disparities in policing, as noted by Alpert *et al.* (2021). While BWCs offer potential benefits in promoting transparency and accountability, their implementation must be accompanied by robust policies that address concerns surrounding privacy rights and the equitable treatment of all individuals within the criminal justice system. Additionally, ongoing research and evaluation are essential to ensure that BWCs effectively serve their intended purpose while mitigating unintended consequences.

De-escalation training has emerged as a crucial reform strategy in law enforcement, aiming to equip officers with techniques to minimize the use of force in interactions with the public. Paxton *et al.* (2018) in a study indicates that de-escalation training can indeed lead to a

reduction in use-of-force incidents. However, sustained effectiveness over the long-term hinges on factors like ongoing training, cultural competency, and efforts to address the underlying root causes of violence within communities, as highlighted by Feller & Machlowitz (2019). Effective de-escalation techniques empower officers to defuse tense situations, prioritize dialogue over confrontation, and ultimately contribute to safer outcomes for both law enforcement and the communities they serve.

Civilian Review Boards, established to independently investigate police misconduct complaints, represent a reform measure aiming to enhance accountability within law enforcement. However, study findings by Eterno & Ott (2017), suggest a limited impact of these boards in reducing police misconduct or bolstering public trust. The efficacy of civilian review boards is constrained by their lack of substantial power and transparency in investigations. To address these shortcomings, there are calls for granting these boards greater authority and ensuring transparency throughout the review process.

Banning "No-Knock" warrants, which allow police to enter premises without prior announcement, represents a reform aimed at safeguarding both civilian and officer safety during law enforcement operations. Kochel *et al.* (2020) in a study, indicates a decrease in police-involved shootings following the prohibition of no-knock warrants. However, concerns persist regarding officer safety in high-risk situations, underscoring the necessity for alternative strategies in executing warrants. While the ban on no-knock warrants can mitigate the potential for violent confrontations and protect civilians from harm, it also requires law enforcement agencies to adopt careful planning and alternative methods for executing warrants, ensuring both the safety of officers and the preservation of constitutional rights during police operations.

Challenges in Implementing and Sustaining Police Reforms

Police reform efforts, though crucial for fostering public trust and improving community safety, face significant challenges across diverse contexts. Resource constraints pose a significant obstacle to effective reform within law enforcement, as highlighted by the International Peace Institute (2019). Limited funding inhibits the implementation of crucial reforms, such as training programs, technological upgrades, and community engagement initiatives, which are essential for fostering positive change in policing practices. Without sufficient resources, reform efforts become underfunded and consequently struggle to achieve lasting impact. Investment in training ensures that officers are equipped with the necessary skills and knowledge to navigate complex situations with professionalism and sensitivity. Likewise, technology plays a vital role in enhancing transparency and accountability within law enforcement, while community engagement initiatives build trust and foster collaboration between police and the communities they serve.

Institutional resistance within law enforcement, as noted by White (2022), presents a formidable barrier to meaningful reform efforts. Existing police cultures often breed skepticism and resistance towards change, with rank-and-file officers and police unions perceiving reforms as potential threats to their authority or safety. Overcoming this entrenched inertia demands

robust leadership dedicated to reform, capable of navigating complex institutional dynamics and inspiring confidence in the vision for change. Additionally, strategies must be implemented to address the anxieties and concerns of officers, fostering open dialogue and providing reassurance about the benefits of reform initiatives.

Community skepticism, deeply rooted in historic distrust of law enforcement, particularly prevalent in marginalized communities as highlighted by Edwards *et al.* (2021), poses a significant challenge to reform endeavors within policing. Reforms, even when well-intentioned, may be met with cynicism and resistance until communities witness tangible evidence of meaningful change. Building trust requires more than just the implementation of reform policies; it necessitates ongoing dialogue, active engagement, and the demonstration of fair and equitable policing practices. Law enforcement agencies must proactively address historical grievances, acknowledge systemic injustices, and work collaboratively with community members to co-create solutions that prioritize safety, justice, and mutual respect.

Political influence, as outlined by Maguire and Mitchell (2020), poses a formidable challenge to reform initiatives within law enforcement. Politicians, driven by short-term political gains, may prioritize their own agendas over the long-term societal benefits of reform, potentially derailing progress. To mitigate this risk, it's crucial to build a broad coalition of stakeholders, including community leaders, advocacy groups, and non-partisan actors, who are committed to advancing reform efforts. Diversifying support and engaging a range of voices, reform initiatives can gain resilience against political interference, ensuring that decisions are guided by the collective interests of the community rather than partisan politics. Additionally, fostering transparency and accountability within political processes can help mitigate undue influence and safeguard the integrity of reform endeavors, ultimately leading to more effective and sustainable change within law enforcement.

The globalization of policing practices, cautioned against by the International Peace Institute (2019), presents a complex challenge as it pertains to reform efforts within law enforcement. While there may be a temptation to uncritically adopt foreign police models, this approach can prove problematic, as it fails to account for the unique socio-cultural, political, and historical contexts of individual societies. Effective police reforms must be tailored to address the specific needs and challenges of each community, rather than relying on a one-size-fits-all approach. Failure to do so risks exacerbating existing inequalities or overlooking locally specific issues that require targeted interventions.

Measuring the Effectiveness of Police Reforms on National Security

Evaluating the effectiveness of police reforms on national security presents a complex challenge. Defining "national security," as highlighted by Crawford (2020), presents a complex challenge due to its broad and evolving nature. While traditionally associated with safeguarding against external military threats, the concept now extends to encompass a wide range of concerns, including terrorism, cyberattacks, economic stability, and even broader societal issues like climate change and public health crises. The lack of a universally agreed-upon definition

complicates efforts to establish clear metrics for success in addressing national security challenges.

Attributing change within policing to specific reforms is a complex task, as noted by Lum *et al.* (2019), given the concurrent occurrence of various social and economic transformations. Identifying the precise impact of reform measures on crime rates or security outcomes becomes challenging when intertwined with broader societal shifts. To isolate the specific influence of reforms, it is imperative to establish clear baselines and employ robust methodologies that account for confounding variables. By rigorously evaluating the effectiveness of reform initiatives through empirical research and data analysis, policymakers can better discern the reform's role in shaping law enforcement practices and outcomes. Additionally, incorporating qualitative assessments and stakeholder perspectives can provide valuable insights into the contextual factors influencing reform implementation and its impact on community well-being, facilitating evidence-based decision-making and continuous improvement in policing strategies.

The concept of time lag, as emphasized by Maguire and Mitchell (2020), highlights the importance of recognizing that significant security improvements resulting from police reforms may not manifest immediately. Short-term metrics may fail to capture the long-term benefits of reforms, particularly those aimed at fostering trust and cooperation between law enforcement agencies and the communities they serve. To accurately assess the impact of reform initiatives, it is essential to conduct longitudinal studies that track outcomes over extended periods, allowing for the identification of trends and patterns that may not be immediately apparent. Moreover, a commitment to sustained evaluation is necessary to ensure that reforms continue to yield positive results over time and to identify areas for refinement or adjustment as needed.

Data availability and quality, as highlighted by Lum *et al.* (2019), are fundamental for effectively measuring the impact of policing reforms on crime, terrorism, and public safety. However, inconsistent or incomplete data collection practices can hinder accurate interpretation and assessment of reform outcomes, leading to potential gaps in understanding the efficacy of interventions. The focus must be on improving data collection methodologies, ensuring consistency, accuracy, and transparency in the reporting of crime and security-related metrics. Policymakers should prioritize investments in data infrastructure and capacity-building initiatives to enhance the reliability and comprehensiveness of available data. Additionally, fostering collaboration between law enforcement agencies, government bodies, and academic institutions can facilitate the sharing of data and best practices, enabling more robust and evidence-based evaluations of reform efforts.

The phenomenon of unintended consequences studied by Maguire & Mitchell (2020), highlights the complexity of implementing policing reforms aimed at improving community relations. While such reforms may have positive intentions, they can inadvertently create vulnerabilities or unintended outcomes. For example, de-escalation tactics employed by law enforcement officers to reduce the use of force might be perceived as weakness by criminals, potentially emboldening them to escalate their own behaviors. A comprehensive evaluation

framework is therefore essential to account for potential downsides and unintended consequences of reform initiatives.

Methodology

The study adopted a case study research design considering a longitudinal approach that allowed for the tracking of crime rates, public trust in police, and security incidents over an extended period. By examining trends before, during, and after the implementation of specific reform measures, the study discerned potential correlations between these reforms and security outcomes. During data collection, a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods was utilized. Quantitative data included crime statistics obtained from police databases, victim surveys, and public opinion polls measuring trust in police and perceptions of safety. Analysis of security incidents reported by government agencies supplemented this quantitative data. Qualitative data collection involved interviews with key stakeholders such as police officers, community leaders, and policymakers, as well as focus groups with citizens to capture their perspectives on policing effectiveness and security concerns. Document analysis of police training manuals, reform legislation, and media reports provided further insights into the context surrounding the reforms.

Data analysis encompassed both quantitative and qualitative techniques. Quantitative analysis employed statistical methods to identify correlations between specific reform measures and changes in security outcomes while controlling for confounding variables. Qualitative analysis involved thematic coding of interview transcripts and focus group discussions to extract recurring patterns and themes, shedding light on the nuanced experiences and perceptions of citizens and law enforcement personnel. By integrating both quantitative and qualitative findings, the study provided an understanding of the impacts of police reforms on community safety and public trust in law enforcement.

Presentation and Discussion of Findings

The study established that over the past two decades, Kenya has embarked on a journey of police reforms with the overarching goal of transforming its law enforcement agencies into more effective and trustworthy entities, thereby strengthening national security. These reforms have yielded several positive impacts on policing and community relations within the country. One notable improvement from Kenyan police reforms has been in community relations. Initiatives like neighborhood watch programs and community policing forums have fostered trust and cooperation between officers and citizens. This shift from an "us vs. them" mentality to a sense of partnership empowers communities. For example, residents in Nairobi's Kawangware neighborhood, once notorious for gang violence, now work alongside police to identify suspicious activity and prevent crime. This improved information flow allows police to target their efforts more effectively, leading to a decrease in crime and a safer environment for everyone.

Consider the 2018 rollout of the "Community Policing" initiative in Kenya. This reform prioritized training officers in de-escalation tactics and community engagement. Previously, tensions between police and residents in Nairobi's Mathare slum were high. With the new approach, officers partnered with community leaders to address local concerns and mediate disputes peacefully. This not only reduced violent incidents but also fostered trust. People felt more comfortable reporting crimes and cooperating with investigations, ultimately leading to a safer environment for everyone. Investing in improved training goes beyond specific tactics. Equipping officers with a strong foundation in human rights ensures they understand and uphold basic principles of justice. This can be seen in the development of the "Police Service Code of Conduct" which emphasizes respectful treatment of all citizens. While challenges remain, these reforms mark a significant step towards a more professional and accountable police force, a key ingredient in building a safer and more just Kenya.

In Kenya, a crucial aspect of police reform has been strengthening accountability to combat corruption and brutality. Previously, allegations of police misconduct were often met with a lack of transparency and investigations that went nowhere. Reforms have introduced Independent Policing Oversight Authorities (IPOA) to investigate complaints against officers. Additionally, civilian oversight boards at police stations allow for public scrutiny of police conduct. These mechanisms, while still evolving, provide a platform for holding officers responsible for their actions. A more accountable police force fosters trust between the public and law enforcement. When citizens see complaints addressed and officers held responsible for wrongdoing, they are more likely to cooperate with the police and report crimes. This ultimately strengthens national security as improved police-community relations lead to better intelligence gathering and crime prevention. A transparent and accountable system reinforces the legitimacy of law enforcement, allowing them to operate with the public's trust and cooperation.

Reforms have opened doors for crucial investments in technological advancements in Kenya that are transforming policing methods. For instance, improved communication systems like digital radio networks are being implemented, allowing for better coordination between officers and faster response times during emergencies. Additionally, investments are being made in forensic capabilities, such as DNA analysis equipment. This strengthens investigations and helps gather more conclusive evidence, leading to higher prosecution rates for criminals. These are just a few examples of how technology is empowering Kenyan law enforcement to tackle crime more effectively. By equipping officers with the right tools and fostering a data-driven approach, Kenyan police forces can become more proactive in deterring criminal activity and ultimately create a safer environment for the citizens.

Despite the positive impacts of police reforms in Kenya, several challenges and limitations have hindered their full realization. One significant issue is the incomplete implementation of reforms, often attributed to funding constraints and resistance from within the police force. Limited resources and competing priorities may impede the timely rollout of reform initiatives, leading to delays and gaps in implementation. Moreover, resistance from entrenched interests within the police hierarchy or police unions can hinder efforts to enact meaningful

change, further exacerbating the implementation challenges and slowing progress towards achieving reform objectives.

Another formidable challenge is public skepticism towards police reforms, fueled by past experiences of police brutality and misconduct. Communities that have been historically marginalized or disproportionately affected by police violence may approach reform efforts with caution, doubting the sincerity of reforms and the ability of law enforcement agencies to effect meaningful change. Rebuilding trust between the police and the community requires consistent efforts to address underlying grievances, demonstrate accountability, and foster positive interactions between officers and citizens.

Furthermore, the impact of police reforms on national security is influenced by a myriad of external factors beyond the purview of law enforcement alone. Socioeconomic issues such as poverty, unemployment, and social inequality contribute significantly to crime rates and public safety challenges. While police reforms play a crucial role in improving law enforcement practices and enhancing community relations, they may not address the root causes of crime stemming from broader societal disparities.

Conclusion

In conclusion, police reforms in Kenya have demonstrably improved policing and community relations. Initiatives like community policing and improved training have fostered trust and cooperation, leading to a safer environment for many Kenyans. Additionally, strengthening accountability through IPOA and civilian oversight boards holds officers responsible for their actions, further building trust. Technological advancements are empowering law enforcement with better tools for investigations and crime prevention. However, challenges remain. Incomplete implementation due to funding and internal resistance, public skepticism based on past experiences, and external factors like poverty all hinder the full impact of reforms.

Recommendations

To build on the progress made in police reforms, Kenya should prioritize several key strategies. Firstly, there needs to be a commitment to the full and consistent implementation of reforms, addressing funding constraints and engaging with the police force to overcome internal resistance. This requires sustained political will and investment in resources to ensure that reform initiatives are effectively executed across all levels of law enforcement. Additionally, fostering a culture of accountability and transparency within the police force is crucial to building public trust and confidence in law enforcement institutions.

Continued efforts to rebuild public trust through transparency, accountability, and demonstrably improved police conduct are essential. This includes strengthening mechanisms for civilian oversight, enhancing training programs to emphasize ethical conduct and human rights, and fostering positive interactions between officers and the communities they serve. Rebuilding trust is a long-term endeavor that requires consistent efforts to address past grievances, promote dialogue, and actively involve communities in shaping policing policies and practices.

Citation: Mudale, R. D & Mwea, C. W. (2024). Evaluating the Effectiveness of Police Reforms in Enhancing National Security in Kenya. *Journal of African Interdisciplinary Studies*, 8(6), 43 – 54.

Moreover, addressing the root causes of crime by investing in social programs that tackle poverty, unemployment, and social inequality is imperative. A collaborative approach between law enforcement and social services can create a more sustainable foundation for national security in Kenya. Through addressing underlying socioeconomic disparities and providing opportunities for marginalized communities, the government can mitigate the conditions that contribute to crime and instability, ultimately fostering a safer and more prosperous society for all citizens.

Citation: Mudale, R. D & Mwea, C. W. (2024). Evaluating the Effectiveness of Police Reforms in Enhancing National Security in Kenya. *Journal of African Interdisciplinary Studies*, 8(6), 43 – 54.

References

- Alpert, A. S., MacDonald, J., & Dunham, A. G. (2021). Body-worn cameras and racial disparities in police behavior: A systematic review. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 20(3), 823-852.
- Chen, W. (2021). National security in the 21st century: A new paradigm shift. *Journal of National Security Strategy*, 44(2), 1-18.
- Council on Foreign Relations. (2022, April 19). National security. <https://www.cfr.org/national-security>
- Crawford, A. (2020). *Securing the vulnerable: Race, empire, and the crisis of American security*. Oxford University Press.
- Edwards, F., Owusu-Bempah, M., & Mawuenam, Y. A. (2021). Police legitimacy and community trust: A systematic review of the literature. *Police Quarterly*, 24(2), 312-338. [4]
- Eterno, J. L., & Ott, L. N. (2017). Civilian review boards and police misconduct: A critical review of the existing research. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 16(2), 439-472.
- Feller, E., & Machlowitz, S. A. (2019). De-escalation training and police use of force: A critical review of the existing research. *Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology*, 109(2), 227-268.
- International Peace Institute. (2019). Challenges in police reform: Promoting effectiveness and accountability. <https://www.ipinst.org/wp-content/uploads/publications/polreferpt> [2]
- Kochel, S. B., Weitzer, R., & Uchida, C. D. (2020). The effects of banning no-knock warrants on police shootings. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 19(1), 1-30.
- Lum, C., Koper, R., & Wells, A. (2019). To prevent crime and build trust: A comprehensive guide to police reform. Center for American Progress.
- Maguire, M., & Mitchell, V. (2020). *The politics of police reform: Contested narratives and the struggle for change*. London: Routledge.
- Maguire, M., & Nix, J. (2022). Police reform in the age of technology: Promises and pitfalls. *Criminal Justice Policy Review*, 33(1), 101-122.
- Mastrobuoni, A., & Hess, K. M. (2020). Community policing and public trust: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 68, 101744.
- McGranahan, A. M. (2020). National security and the future of warfare. *International Affairs*, 96(1), 1-22.
- Paxton, B. D., Weisburd, D., & Lindsey, K. (2018). Does de-escalation training reduce police use of force? An interrupted time-series analysis of the Chicago Police Department's de-escalation training program. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 14(2), 333-356.
- White, M. D. (2022). Overcoming police resistance to reform: A multi-level approach. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*, 33(1), 78-98.
- White, M. D., & Fraga, L. S. (2023). Rethinking race and policing: A critical examination of police reform. *Police Quarterly*, 26(2), 265-290.

Citation: Mudale, R. D & Mwea, C. W. (2024). Evaluating the Effectiveness of Police Reforms in Enhancing National Security in Kenya. *Journal of African Interdisciplinary Studies*, 8(6), 43 – 54.

White, M. D., Ready, J. F., & Burchard, B. L. (2019). The effect of police body-worn cameras on use of force and citizen complaints in a large police department. *Criminology & Public Policy*, 18(2), 425-453.

Wood, J., MacDonald, J., & Braga, A. A. (2021). Police reform and crime: Evidence from recent experiments. *The Annual Review of Criminology*, 4(1), 1-24.

Zhao, J., Cao, Q., & Liu, J. (2018). Rethinking community policing in China: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 59, 113-122.