KENYATTA UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC POLICY AND ADMINISTRATION

EFFECTS OF KENYA’S MIGRATION POLICY ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING: THE
CASE STUDY OF KENYA-SOMALIA BORDER, GARISSA COUNTY

ABDI ADEN MOHAMED

REG. NO.: C153/OL/GAR/32159/2016

A RESEARCH PROJECT SUBMITTED TO THE SCHOOL OF HUMANITIES AND
SOCIAL SCIENCES IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENT FOR THE
AWARD OF THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF PUBLIC POLICY AND
ADMINISTRATION OF KENYATTA UNIVERSITY

OCTOBER 2018
DECLARATION

Declaration by the Student

This thesis is my original work and has not been presented for a degree in any other university.

Abdi Aden Mohamed

Signature ………………………… Date…………………………

Declaration by the Supervisor

This thesis has been submitted for the review with the approval of the University supervisor.

Signature ………………………… Date…………………………

Dr Wilson Muna……………………………………………………………….
DEDICATION

I dedicate this study to my dear wife Azza, my princess Afaaf and the entire family, for their love and unstinting support throughout the study.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I do thank the Almighty God for giving me the knowledge, strength and zeal to undertake this project and the entire course to its completion. Secondly, I do express my sincere appreciation to my supervisor; Dr. Wilson Muna for the support and guidance he gave me throughout my research. His input helped me shape this work and made its completion possible. Similarly, thanks goes to the department of public policy headed by Prof Minja and the entire team for guiding my work.
ABSTRACT

The project is about the assessment of the Kenya’s migration policy and the effects it has on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia Border, Garissa County. Migration is defined as the movement of people from one place to another due to various reasons. Migration and trafficking have a close connection. It is important that efforts to curb human trafficking be approached from a migration angle. Overall migration has been used by international organizations when formulating policies and laws that curb trafficking. Trafficking involves recruiting, transporting and harboring individuals by use of threats and coercion and exploiting them. The purpose of this research was to investigate the impact the migration policy in Kenya on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa town, Garissa County. It established how the county is implementing the policy and if cases of human trafficking have dropped or not after the introduction of the policy. The study was based on the following specific objectives: to ascertain the effects of migration policies on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County; to determine the effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County; and to assess the challenges that affect the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. This study used the descriptive research design. This research design was beneficial to the researcher, as it allowed triangulation in the study. Qualitative and quantitative data complemented each other in the study. The target population for this study comprised of immigration officers, prosecutors, judges and police officers (Anti-Terrorism Police Unit) in Garissa. A total study population of 152 targeted of which 113 samples was used. The sample used was arrived at following the table format guided by Krejcie and Morgan. Analysis of quantitative data was done using descriptive statistics by the help of SPSS version 23. Qualitative data was analysed in themes. Qualitative data was identified and analysed in themes (patterns). The research looked across all the data to identify the main themes and give a summary of all the views collected. Thematic analysis was used to interpret different aspects of research and simply organize and describe data set in details. Findings indicate that whereas there exist clear and well laid out migration policies, they have not been significantly effective in curbing human trafficking in the study area, owing to a variety of inadequacies in their formulation, enactment and execution. It was also found that various socio-economic factors constitute the underlying factors and are responsible for increasing human trafficking cases across the Kenya-Somalia border, as well as inhibiting enforcement efforts to curb the same. Findings further reveal that a myriad of challenges hamper efforts to implementation migration policies in the country, with a view to curb human trafficking.
### ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ATPU</td>
<td>Anti-Terror Police Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HT</td>
<td>Human Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDPs</td>
<td>Internally Displaced Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KII</td>
<td>Key Informant Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KNBS</td>
<td>Kenya National Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoH</td>
<td>Ministry of Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACOSTI</td>
<td>National Commission for Science, Technology and Innovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMMS</td>
<td>Regional Mixed Migration Secretariat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPSS</td>
<td>Statistical Package for Social Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TI</td>
<td>Transparency International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNHCR</td>
<td>United Nations High Commission for Refugees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNODC</td>
<td>United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Human trafficking channels in East Africa ................................................................. 16
Table 3.1: Extract of Sample size determination table ................................................................. 28
Table 3.2: The sampling frame .................................................................................................. 28
Table 4.1 Response Rate ............................................................................................................ 32
Table 4.2 Cronbach’s Alpha Coefficients .................................................................................... 33
Table 4.3 Response by Gender ................................................................................................... 34
Table 4.4 Migration Policies and Human Trafficking ................................................................. 41
Table 4.5 Socio-economic Factors and Human Trafficking ....................................................... 45
Table 4.6 Challenges in the Implementation of Migration Policy ............................................. 49
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1 Conceptual Framework (Author- Researcher 2018) ......................................................... 24
Figure 4.1 Response by Age .................................................................................................................. 35
Figure 4.2 Response by Qualifications .................................................................................................. 36
Figure 4.3 Length of Service .................................................................................................................. 37
Figure 4.4 Response by Job Cadre ......................................................................................................... 38
Figure 4.5 Extent of Human Trafficking Cases ....................................................................................... 39
OPERATIONAL DEFINITION OF TERMS

**Human trafficking**- illegal movement of individuals by force or through threats, lies in order to exploit them sexually, slavery or to remove body organs.

**Domestic trafficking**- the illegal movement of people within the borders of a country.

**Cross-border trafficking**- the illegal movement of people across the borders of a country.

**Smuggling**- this refers to an organized way of transporting individuals across the borders in exchange of money and usually involves dangerous conditions.

**Migration**- the movement of people from one place to another.

**Migration policy**- guidelines used to address the movement of people in a country.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATION.................................................................................................................. ii
DEDICATION.................................................................................................................... iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT....................................................................................................... ii
ABSTRACT......................................................................................................................... v
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS.................................................................................. vi
LIST OF TABLES ................................................................................................................ vii
LIST OF FIGURES .............................................................................................................. vii
OPERATIONAL DEFINITION OF TERMS.......................................................................... viii
CHAPTER ONE .................................................................................................................... 1
INTRODUCTION.................................................................................................................. 1
  1.0 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 1
  1.1 Background of the study ............................................................................................ 1
  1.2 Statement of the problem ......................................................................................... 3
  1.3 Objectives of the study ............................................................................................ 4
    1.3.1 Specific objectives .............................................................................................. 4
  1.4 Research questions .................................................................................................. 4
  1.5 Justification and the Significance of the study ......................................................... 5
  1.6 Scope and Limitations ............................................................................................. 5
CHAPTER TWO .................................................................................................................... 7
LITERATURE REVIEW ........................................................................................................ 7
  2.0 Introduction ................................................................................................................ 7
  2.1 Human Trafficking .................................................................................................... 7
  2.2 Migration Policies ..................................................................................................... 8
    2.2.1 Compliance ........................................................................................................ 9
    2.2.2 Enforcement ...................................................................................................... 10
    2.2.3 Appraisal ......................................................................................................... 12
    2.2.4 Relevance ........................................................................................................ 13
  2.3 Socio Economic Factors .......................................................................................... 14
    2.3.1 Porous borders ................................................................................................. 15
    2.2.2 Political Instability and Ethnic Tensions ............................................................ 16
4.2.3 Response by Qualifications ................................................................. 36
4.2.4 Response by Work Experience ............................................................. 37
4.2.5 Response by Job Cadre ........................................................................ 38
4.2.6 Extent of Human Trafficking Cases ....................................................... 39
4.3 Migration Policies .................................................................................... 40
4.4 Socio-economic Factors ......................................................................... 44
4.5 Challenges in the Implementation of Migration Policy ............................ 48

CHAPTER FIVE .................................................................................................. 52

SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS .............................. 52

5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................. 52
5.2 Summary of Key Findings ........................................................................ 52
5.3 Conclusion ............................................................................................... 54
5.4 Recommendations ..................................................................................... 55
5.5 Suggestions for Further Studies ............................................................... 56

REFERENCES .................................................................................................. 57

APPENDICES ..................................................................................................... 68

A1: Study’s Timeline ....................................................................................... 68
A2: Budget for the study ................................................................................. 68
A3.1: Questionnaire ......................................................................................... 69
A3.2 Interview Guide ....................................................................................... 75
A3.3 Observation Guide .................................................................................. 77
CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION

1.0 Introduction

Migration can be defined as the movement of people from one place to another due to various reasons. This section covers the background of the study, statement of the problem, purpose of the study, objectives, research questions, significance of the study, scope and limitations of the study.

1.1 Background of the Study

The problem of human trafficking has been reported in most parts of the world. It has been reported that 90% of countries of the world have a law that criminalizes human trafficking. This is especially after the United Nations Convention enacted the procedure to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, more so women and children. However, despite this legislation, very few convictions have been reported across the globe. For example, between 2010 and 2012, in about 40% of the countries there were less than 10 convictions. Human trafficking and smuggling is affected by the affluence of countries. We find that rich countries act as destination areas for trafficked individuals from different continents and regions of the world. Sub regional or domestic trafficking is left for the poorer countries, (Global Report on Trafficking in Persons, 2014).

Migration and trafficking have a close connection. It is important that efforts to curb human trafficking be approached from a migration angle. Overall migration has been used by international organizations when formulating policies and laws that curb trafficking, (Larsen,
According to UN, (2004) definition of trafficking, it involves recruiting, transporting and harboring individuals by use of threats and coercion and exploiting them. Fraud, abduction and abuse of power are some of the ways people use to traffic others. Migration on the other hand is movement of people from one place to another without any coercion. Refugees, displaced persons and other people move for different reasons, (IOM, 2013). Migration usually involves large numbers of people thus traffickers take advantage of the situation to do this illicit trade.

The current conditions and economic factors have greatly contributed to human trafficking becoming one of the fast-growing crimes committed across borders. There is increased demand and supply to facilitate the trade. Increased social economic and demographic disparities between the developing and the developed world brought by poverty, terrorism, intra and interstate conflicts have sustained supply for human smuggling and trafficking trade. The feminization of poverty and marginalization of many rural communities have also fed human smuggling and trafficking trade with many migrants who are ready to be smuggled especially women (Shelley, 2010). Kenya is the main destination country for migrants coming from the Eastern and Central Africa as well as other continents. Additionally, the country experiences robust intraregional migration with her neighbours in East Africa. Kenya shares more than 4,000km of extremely porous borders with, Somalia, Ethiopia, Uganda, Tanzania and Sudan. Nearly all of these nations continue to experience natural disasters and armed conflict, thereby increasing the probability of irregular migrations.

The trends in Africa and particularly East Africa have shaped the migration policy in Kenya. The migration trends in East Africa have made Kenya become a preferred migration destination.
Migrants enter Kenya through the authorized migration channels that are faced with illegalities in search of economic development, (TI, 2011). The porosity at the Kenyan borders has given an opportunity for migrants to move easily into the country. Asylum seekers and refugees take advantage of the presence of internally displaced persons (IDPs) and find their way into the country. Violence, natural disasters, violation of human rights have been contributing factors to an increase in IDPs, refugees and asylum seekers, (IOM, 2011).

1.2 Statement of the Problem

The problem of human trafficking associated with migration in Kenya has increased despite having migration policies in place to address such problems. There are policy documents that have a provision to help curb the human trafficking in Kenya which include; The National Diaspora Policy, Kenya Vision 2030, National Labor Migration Policy and National Migration Policy. In addition to these, Kenya has further domesticated the international instruments by putting domestic legislative mechanisms in place to combat human trafficking and other transnational organized crimes. These legislations include the Counter Trafficking in Persons Act 2010, the prevention of Terrorist act 2012 and the New Security Amendments Act 2014. Despite these efforts, Kenya continues to be a source, transit and final destination of illegal migration (US State Department, 2014).

In the region, Kenya has been a hub for migration both as a transit route, destination and source of trafficking. Individuals use Kenya as a route to traffic people to South Africa and other parts in Africa, Europe and America. There are two main routes established for trafficking; the Kenya-Somalia border through Garissa is the north eastern route and Kenya-Uganda border through
Busia-Malaba in the western side, (IOM, 2015). Human trafficking exposes people to exploitation such as domestic violence, manual labour, engaging in prostitution in massage centers or even brothels. Women and children suffer more with this practice and some end up in sex tourism against their will. The migration policy and other regulations seek to end this inhuman practice to restore dignity to humanity. It is against this background that an assessment of Kenya’s migration policy and its effect on human trafficking was necessary.

1.3 Objectives of the Study

The purpose of this research was to investigate the impact the migration policy in Kenya on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa town, Garissa County.

1.3.1 Specific Objectives

1. To ascertain the effects of migration policies on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County.

2. To determine the effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County.

3. To assess the challenges that affect the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County.

1.4 Research Questions

1. What are the effects of migration policies on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County?
2. What are the effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County?
3. What are the challenges that affect the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County?

1.5 Justification and the Significance of the Study

The period 2010-2015 has seen enactment of many laws touching on migrants smuggling and other transnational organized crimes. Despite these measures in place Kenya has experienced increased irregular migration. The study findings will help the government in the formulation of new migration policies and review of the existing ones to ensure they work as desired. The findings will also be useful to migration experts and scholars as they will increase knowledge in the field and provide empirical evidence on how the existing policies are working. The findings of this study will also indirectly help people vulnerable to human trafficking as improved policies as a result of this evaluation will make them less vulnerable to human trafficking. The study will be conducted in Garissa County due to the high number of refugees and asylum seekers who reside there. The porosity of the Kenya-Somalia border is another reason for the choice of the study area.

1.6 Scope and Limitations

This study was conducted within Kenya and specifically focused on points of entry, points of exits and routes used by human traffickers. This study targeted to interview immigration officials, human trafficking victims, security personnel, international organizations staff as well as experts in migration and human trafficking. This study covered the period between 2010 and
2015, because it was 2010 when Kenya domesticated and enacted the Counter Trafficking in Persons Act of 2010 to combat migrant smuggling and human trafficking.

Due to time and financial constrains this study covered all points of entry and exit but concentrated on more specifically Kenya-Somalia border in Garissa town. However, the findings from the study can inform any other studies and researches that could be conducted in similar circumstances in other parts of the country.
CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.0 Introduction

This chapter covers the review of the relevant literature in migration and human trafficking. The chapter begins with an overview of migration trends and migrant characteristics. It also examines impact of migration on a number of issues such as population and development. The chapter further discusses the link between human trafficking and migration, as well as the policies and regulations that form the governance framework of migration issues. A look at possible challenges affecting implementation of such policies will be looked into as well. A theoretical framework that will be used to guide the study will also be looked at.

2.1 Human Trafficking

Human trafficking, (HT) is a process where people are moved by force or coercion from one place to another and exploitation is done, (Roth & Venia, 2011). The main distinguishing characteristics of HT are that it involves the use force and exploitation, removal of organs, sexual abuse, slavery and even forced labor which can occur during human trafficking, (Gastrow, 2011). This vice is closely intertwined with migrant smuggling where organized groups make the movement of individuals across the borders occur in exchange of money. These individuals are subjected to harsh living conditions in the destination country. Human trafficking leads to illicit economic gain in the destination country since the smuggled individuals have no right to defend themselves. In Africa for example, human trafficking poses a high security threat and in general negatively affect the lives of people with resulting diminished moral and social fabric, (Reitano et al, 2014.)
Domestic trafficking is also experienced whereby individuals are trafficked within the borders of a country, (Reitano et al, 2014). This is common especially where children and women are trafficked as a source of domestic labour or even prostitution. Children both boys and girls are targeted victims of domestic trafficking as they provide cheap labour. Poverty and the high economic situation is a prevailing condition that promotes human trafficking. A sorry case was reported in Kenya in September 2010 where one trafficker was arrested trafficking children, ten in number five boys five girls aged as young as 10 months and 10 years, (Gastrow, 2011).

2.2 Migration Policies

The four policy documents in Kenya that have a reference on migration include; the National Migration Policy; Kenya Vision 2030; the National Diaspora Policy and the National Labour Migration Policy. The Vision 2030 is a national planning strategy. Its ultimate goal is to guarantee that Kenya is transformed to a middle-income country and the citizen’s quality of life is improved. It makes little reference to migration. The National Migration Policy and the National Labor Migration on the other hand both remain in draft form. The National Diaspora Policy was launched in 2015. This document helps to ensure that Kenyans who live abroad have their share in developing the nation and their rights safeguarded. The policy looks at the living conditions of these people (RMMS, 2013).

Dual citizenship is permitted in the Kenya Constitution (2010). It is also enshrined in the constitution on the freedom of movement and the rights granted to leave the country. There are other laws and regulations on migration such as the Kenya Citizens and Foreign Nationals Management Service Act; The Kenya Citizenship and Immigration Act and related regulations;
the Security Laws Amendment Act; the Prevention, Protection and Assistance to IDP’s and Affected Communities Act; the Refugees Act, and the Counter Trafficking in Persons Act. Kenya has also signed international and regional legislations and treaties in relation to migration (Kenya Constitution, 2010). Against this backdrop, the present study seeks to find out how the compliance, enforcement, appraisal and relevance of the foregoing policies affect human trafficking in Kenya in general and in the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County in particular.

2.2.1 Compliance

Whereas the anti-trafficking policies and legislations have become more widespread around the world, compliance across the large majority of nations in the Middle East and Africa remains low (Haynes, 2014; UNODC, 2009). Haynes (2014) and UNODC (2012) argue that this could be attributed to the fact that most African and the Middle Eastern countries have not yet included such legislation and policies into their domestic laws. Furthermore, nations with criminal codes, which are usually common in those with civil law, such as Sudan and Morocco, list human trafficking as offences but do not describe what it is within their anti-human trafficking policies (UNODC, 2012).

Gibson (2015) intimates that many of the messages arising from collective processes including international protocols and treaties reiterate the necessity for cooperation and consistency in order to increase awareness and create effective anti-trafficking mechanisms, which would raise compliance levels. However, notwithstanding the continuing struggles, especially in the last decade, many affirmations of intent to work at a regional and national level fail to come to fruition. Their arguments are consistent with Farr (2015) who argues that factors such as firm
government buy-in as well as the absence of political will and resources play a part in the sluggishness. Convincing research, inspiring action plans and proposed partnerships and frameworks all look great on paper, but failure to implement results in zero gains marked by significantly low compliance levels (Farr, 2015).

According to Feingold (2015), unfortunately, the absence of clarity, agreement and facts on human trafficking as well as considerably low awareness levels of the crime compounds human trafficking policy formulation and compliance challenges. Accordingly, Belser (2016) offers that awareness-raising campaigns and programmes must be carried out in a country’s principal language to effectively inform individuals, media, communities, and law enforcement agencies. Similarly, Esquibel (2015) argues that awareness and sensitivity training should be done to all the relevant stakeholders including magistrates, law enforcement and all the relevant government departments.

2.2.2 Enforcement

Globally, not only in Kenya, immigration, the police, as well as other law enforcement agencies have been experiencing challenges in law enforcement with a view to curtail human trafficking. Europol (2014), in a commentary, attributes the above to the desperation of individuals who are gullible to the deception that better jobs and plenty employment opportunities lie in wait for them abroad, only to end up human trafficking victims. In most cases, the law enforcement team in view of the circumstances are usually taken as the enemies of progress. Consistent with this commentary, Mendelson (2015) observes that legislation offers the basis on which law enforcement practices such as prosecution of any violation are anchored. Such legislations could
also be drawn from international treaties to which a State is signatory, which could presuppose that the sanctioning state domesticates that treaty with a view to align it to the context of that individual state. Such complexities according to Mendelson (2015) bring about discrepancies which curtail the law enforcement process.

Alemica (2013) argues that since even with the presence of adequate policies and legislation, effective implementation may be wanting due to inadequacy of necessary resources like manpower, there is need to strengthen law enforcement. The problem is worsened by the absence of law enforcement authority. Robinson (2014) adds that efficacious law enforcement limits the propagation of organized crime hence combating human trafficking. However, organized crime, where it is fruitful, corrupts officials with a view to raise profits, hence weakening a state’s sovereignty. This calls for a strengthened law enforcement (van Dijck, 2015).

According to Ruggeri and Burgoon (2012), the existing laws need to be effectively implement to ensure successful arrests and prosecutions of traffickers. This is in line with the commendations in the UNODC’s 2012 Global Report on Trafficking in Persons, which advocated for intensified prosecutions due to the very low reported conviction rates: amid 132 countries, 16% did not report even a single conviction between 2007 and 2010. One included article appropriately noted that the activities of “Traffickers’ are not difficult to document, nonetheless they continue to be witnessed. Despite arrests by police and fines to traffickers, their activities have not ceased. Their proceeds are shared amongst the local community leaders, police, club members, etc. Evidently, the local society alone does not have the power nor the proper mechanisms to stop
them. For this to be effectively achieved, it requires a political will and a police force operating at a higher level.”

2.2.3 Appraisal

Studies principally assess the policies or give recommendations for better policy (Sadruddin, Natalia & Hidalgo, 2015; Jakobsson & Andreas, 2016; Kangaspunta, 2013). Agendas, moral panics and public opinion are often included in trafficking policies because very little is known about the scope of the problem (Jahic & Finckenauer, 2015), hence making it difficult to enact a solution.

Existing literature (Lusk & Lucas, 2013; Kangaspunta, 2013; Jakobsson & Andreas, 2016) centers on position papers and incidental evidence that becomes the footing for policies driven on political symbolism and assumptions. Consequently, scholars (Jahic & Finckenauer, 2005; Sadruddin et al., 2015; Mendelson, 2015) advocate that policies should be adaptable and accommodate changes and new information. Furthermore, the policies need to center on fighting all kinds of human trafficking and all types of casualties. Oxman-Martinez and Gomez (2005) debate that “various human trafficking policies only focus on child, women and victims of sex trafficking”. As a matter of fact, by 2008 twenty-seven nations across the globe didn’t have covering definitions of human trafficking hence excluded forced labor and/or male child victims (UNODC, 2012).

Obokata (2016) opines that surrounding policy to specific types of victim at the expense of others is difficult. Current trends indicate that most trafficking victims are labor trafficking
victims and include men, women, and children. The offense of human trafficking is very
dynamic, and therefore policies should be flexible enough to accommodate these changing
trends. Lastly, Robinson (2014) advocates for the inclusion of NGO’s in the formation of
policies relating to human trafficking, “a top-down legislative approach is not sustainable as it
assumes the existence of an effective governmental framework, enforcement of laws, and a
strong legal system”.

2.2.4 Relevance

Parrot and Nina (2016) point out that for policy effectiveness in curbing human trafficking, the
formulation ought to be informed by the realization that human trafficking is a modern form of
slavery and a global reality that continues to gain momentum. International experts (Europol,
2014; Esquibel, 2015; Limoncelli, 2015) estimate that at any one given time in the world, 2.5
million people are recruited, trapped and conveyed for abuse. They add that “it is a billion-dollar
business, similar to the trade in arms and drugs, and appears to be thriving rather than
diminishing”. Parrot and Nina (2016) add that policies aimed at inhibiting human trafficking
have to define in clear terms what the concept entails, adding that human trafficking fellows
many faces including slave labour, bride selling, commercial sexual exploitation, organ
harvesting, forced begging debt bondage, exploitation during armed conflict, forced drug dealing
and the use of juvenile soldiers (Europol, 2014; Esquibel, 2015).

Poulin (2013) points out that victims of trafficking can be abused in various industries including
construction, agriculture, domestic service, manufacturing, tourism, and sex industries.
Migration policies should as such clearly identify demand as a steering force fueling trafficking
and subsequently employ measures that will help to reduce the demand such as reducing corruption; targeting individuals; facilitating victim assistance and identification; and increasing the penalties for perpetrators. Accordingly, Obokata (2016) argues that policy makers should recognize the intersection between gender inequality, poverty and human trafficking, and consequently address these in their poverty reduction and women empowerment strategies.

Limoncelli (2015) asserts that it is relevant and extremely important for human trafficking policies to acknowledge that human traffickers buy and sell individuals and that it is slavery in the modern world; basically, illegally detaining individuals for others’ use. Regrettably, Richelson (2012) discovered that the victims of this crime are mostly women and that these women are treated as commodities readily available for buy and sell. Moreover, she also indicated that this is a multi-billion dollar business with an ever increasing demand. Against this backdrop, Feingold (2015) adds that human trafficking policies ought to be sensitive to the capacity in which victims of human trafficking work in, observing that there is an extensive range of work that the victims are forced to do. The most popular is prostitution and sexual favors. Other jobs comprise, but are not limited to, sweatshop work, domestic servitude, and restaurant personnel. As such, human trafficking polices ought to cut across line sectors including labor and particular recruitment in pertinent industries.

**2.3 Socio Economic Factors**

A vast majority of empirical literature links an array of socio-economic factors to human trafficking. In this regard, the present study zeros in on four most prevalent factors in literature. These include porous borders, political instability and ethnic tensions and economic stability.
2.3.1 Porous Borders

According to Odhiambo (2012), border control is a wide-ranging reaction to unlawful immigration, exhibited by how countries have reacted by the use of their migration policies. Within the context of, and part of measures aimed at preventing and deterring illegal migration is international cooperation with a view to address human trafficking. Among the conventional methods for addressing the cross-border vice is enactment of legislation and strict border regulation. In response to the exponential increase in human trafficking activities, many states have reacted by strengthening their borders. Throughout Africa, perceived destination regions such as Western Europe and the United States, border control expenditure is speedily growing.

Coupled with compromised law enforcers, the extensive and porous Kenyan border with her neighbors facilitates human trafficking to destinations around the world and in Africa across the borders. The Kenya National Crime Research Centre (2014), reports that the most trafficked through the Kenya border, most notoriously Moyale and exits through Namanga border to South Africa are Ethiopians escaping lack of employment and political persecution. The report also found that Eritreans and Somalis who are escaping war conflicts and political upheavals are trafficked through Mandera to Garissa then to Nairobi.

As presented in the table below, the National Crime research Centre report (2014) further shows that Kenya is used as a destination, transit and country of origin in human trafficking. The report further revealed that Kenya offers a beneficial channel for movement owing to its corrupt law enforcement officers and porous borders.
Table 2.1: Human trafficking channels in East Africa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country of origin</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>40.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>67.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>29.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Sudan</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries of transit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eritrea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somalia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yemen</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries of destination</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudi Arabia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: National Crime research Centre report (2014)

2.2.2 Political Instability and Ethnic Tensions

Political instability, according to Hysi (2012), can include government changes (such as military takeovers or coup d’états), varying levels of political violence, including conflict and protests (Newman and Cameron 2016; Bales, 2009; Parrot and Cummings, 2016; Cameron, 2014). One of the most substantial forecasters of human trafficking is conflict (Miko, 2011; Troubnikoff 2013; Mertus and Bertone, 2013; Bales et. al 2009; Cameron and Newman 2016; True 2012). It can significantly and adversely impact a specific government, country, rule of law, capacity to provide for the people, as well as the government’s ability to defend its citizens from human rights exploitations (Parrot & Cummings, 2016; Cameron, 2014).

As was the case, in the Kosovo during the conflict (Seelke & Siskin, 2015), people may, during and after conflict, be displaced to other countries as refugees or become Internally Displaced
Persons (IDPs) (Bales, 2015; Hughes, 2010; Grant, 2012) this may result to an increased supply of people to become trafficked (Kara, 2009; Shelley, 2014). According to Shelley (2014), depending on the scale and severity of the conflict, and other security measures, governance is disrupted, including border controls, and protection in the form of law enforcement, among others, which propagate human trafficking. State capacity is also reduced by large population flows, which may promote more instability, worsen governance during and after conflict, and ultimately human trafficking (Grant, 2012).

Salehyan (2011) reports that in order to avoid state repression, rebel groups use external reserves in other countries besides their own, which enables them to continue to avoid punishment and carry out operations at lower costs. Salehyan and Gleditsch (2016) report that during conflict, migratory channels assist in establishing rebel social networks. This supports Grant (2012) who found a link between migrant workers, refugees and human trafficking, which suggest that in either autocratic or corrupt nations, or in countries with low risk for punishment, traffickers may have sanctuaries afforded to them.

### 2.2.3 Economic Stability

According to Shelley (2014), people are more vulnerable to being trafficked when they are more desperate to find new opportunities. Skeldon (2012) adds that unfulfilled labor markets pull people to new countries and lack of economic opportunity and poverty push people to seek new labor opportunities. On the supply side of poverty, are individuals whose economic survival needs are not met coupled with constrained means to meet these requirements. The demand side of poverty on the other hand (Ruggeri & Burgoon, 2012) refers to those agricultural, industrial or
commercial establishments and jobs that rely on these penurious persons being illegally trafficked, in order to sustain a profit.

Jones, David, Engstrom and Mariel (2011) opine that persons who cannot cloth, feed, and shelter themselves due to unemployment are the most vulnerable to the baits of traffickers. Sadruddin et al. (2015) offer that as a cause of human trafficking, the poverty level of the victims does play a significant role, adding that the more likely to be trafficked are those persons who are wanting in some basic human respects compared to those persons who have attained some level of comparative affluence and have all their basic needs provided.

Jakobsson and Andreas (2016) provide that the demand side of labor includes those persons and/or businesses that consciously employ trafficked persons at non-existent or very low wages, whether referring to sex slaves or forced labor in factories. The demand side of poverty according to Kangaspunta (2013) refers to those firms that capitalize on frequently forced and cheap labor. Many businesses within the developing countries are unable to meet the increasing demands for low cost labor in agricultural and industrial pursuits hence taking advantage of the victims of poverty that cross borders in search of employment, (Jakobsson & Andreas, 2016).

2.3 Challenges

This section explores the literature for challenges curtailing human trafficking policies. It delves into both international and Kenyan literature and focuses on four most common challenges identified in literature, which include: corruption, technology, human resource capacity
2.3.1 Corruption

Corruption and human trafficking are indisputably linked. Mendelson (2015) suggests a strong relationship between the two, hence concluding that countries with high levels of institutional corruption are more likely to have high levels of human trafficking within their borders. Shelley (2014) notes that trafficking ‘hot spots’ correlate to regions with perceived impunity for public corruption. This is further supported by the OECD’s comparison of the US TIP Report 2014 with Transparency International’s 2014 Corruption Perception Index. This comparison indicated a marked overlap amongst countries classified as having a critical human trafficking dilemma and countries perceived as experiencing serious corruption. A report in 2015 displays comparable outcomes. These conclusions are supported by victims’ accounts, which validate the thesis that corruption amongst public officials aids the trafficking of individuals.

Corruption enables human trafficking to flourish. As Martin and Smith (2014) intimate, corruption bolsters trafficking in four ways: corruption (1) facilitates impunity even if trafficking is detected; (2) permits the crime of human trafficking to remain unseen; (3) rises the danger of victimization for trafficking victims; and (4) facilitates trafficking circuits in the country. Corruption leaves victims unable to seek assistance from law enforcement, terrified and undermines efforts to combat human trafficking.

Opportunities for corruption stretch across a wide range of official positions and branches of government. The results of a UNODC (2012) study showed that law enforcement officials (border control, police, customs officials and immigration) are the most likely people to take part in trafficking-related corruption. While corruption is more prevalent within this group, a review
of available evidence confirms that the reach of corruption is indeed much broader. The Council of Europe, for example, also adds intelligence/security forces and armed forces to the list. Mbeo and Sambo (2011) argue that bribery is another key means by which public officials use their position to facilitate — and to profit from — human trafficking. UNCAC defines bribery as: “The offering, promise, or giving, to a public official, directly or indirectly, of an unjustifiable benefit, for the official herself or himself or another person or entity, in order that the official act or refrain from acting in the exercise of his or her official duties. In the context of trafficking, the ‘undue advantage’ that officials receive or solicit mostly comes in form of money or sexual services.

2.3.2 Technology

According to Jakobsson and Andreas (2016), “today a huge number of technologies play an important role in the daily lives of human beings, from those technologies which permit us to interact with other technologies that enable us to track our finances”. Accordingly, Ruggeri and Burgoon (2012) argue that “it is essential to study how they are employed both in the human trafficking processes as well as in combatting human trafficking”.

Pati (2014) asserts that “SNS and key applications that enable a two-way communication and the sharing of video and image material are helpful in the recruitment and exploitation of trafficked persons.” Hewson (2010) adds that “users of SNS disclose information about themselves, unknowingly or knowingly.” It can take place in a Facebook post, when posting a tweet, checking in at a hotel via TripAdvisor or uploading a picture to Instagram. It is possible for traffickers, due to technical improvements, such as the openness of numerous SNS and location
tracking, to gain a wide pool of data on trafficked persons. It therefore becomes crucial that persons are informed about the hazards of making available publicly, this personal information.

Various technologies have been identified in literature (Belser, 2015; Whitman & David, 2015) as potentially playing a role in facilitating or to fight and prevent human trafficking. The facilitating technologies include software such as: Advertising and classifieds, Adult entertainment sites, Applications, Dark web, Computer games, E-mail, Peer to peer networks (P2P), Online dating sites and SNS; and hardware such as video technologies and camera and associated outputs including laptop, desktop and tablets, Television, as well as Scanners. The technologies that can potentially assist in combatting human trafficking include software such as Case management tools, Police Computerization System and data base (CPCS), Database, E-learning training programs, financial tracking, Facial Reconstruction (software), Geographic information system, Online Collaboration Platform, Online petition, Podcasts, Supply chain management toolkit, Cable television, Closed Circuit Television (CCTV), and Routers and backup devices.

2.3.3 Human Resource Capacity

Without adequate training, reliable data, and established protocols for investigating trafficking cases and identifying victims, law enforcement officers either do not investigate at all, or work on a case-by-case basis. Farrell et al. (2016) found out that “local law enforcement agencies do not acknowledge human trafficking as a “widespread” problem in their areas.” They further report that “in fact, 50 to 60 percent of the respondents in a countrywide random sample reported sex trafficking and labor as non-existent in their communities.” Approximately 20
percent of “law enforcement agencies implied they were uncertain about the incidence of human trafficking in their communities,” and less than 10% of the respondents in a random sample saw human trafficking as a serious problem that needs to be addressed (Farrell et al., 2016).

The Greater Cincinnati Human Trafficking Report established that “approximately 50% of the law enforcement officers answered ‘fair’ or ‘poor’ when asked about their awareness of human trafficking. Virtually all the other law enforcement officers reported not knowing. (National Underground Railroad Freedom Network [NURFR], 2009, p. 9). From a random sample of county, local, and state law enforcement agencies, Farrell et al, (2016) found that “18% of such agencies had implemented training on human trafficking, and 39% of medium to large agencies had implemented training” (p. 61). A different study, comprising of 83 agencies, found that only 8% of them “had received or conducted training in human trafficking” (Wilson et al., 2016).

2.4 Theoretical Framework

Migration and human trafficking is a wide and complex field. Because of its complexity and dynamism, it is quite inadequate to use one approach in understanding it. In order to have a watertight view of the topic, one theory has been reviewed to explain migration and human trafficking i.e. migration business theory by Salt and Stein (2002).

Salt & Stein, (2002) were developers of the migration business theory. They bring an assumption that migration is a business that has both illegal and legal aspects. The products in this business are migrants while the smugglers are entrepreneurs. The theory conceives that the business of migration that allows movement of people from points of origin to another destination promotes human trafficking and smuggling of immigrants. Aranowitz (2009) a proponent of this theory, argues that smuggling and trafficking might not have escalated to such heights if it were not
sustained by strong market supply and demand forces. The three important areas in the theory are source, transit and destination countries for the business. At the country of origin or source, recruitment of migrants takes place while transit is the country they pass through as they head to a certain destination. At their destination country, integration of migrants into the diaspora labor markets and host societies takes place. However, the theory assumes that the law of demand and supply is the major underlying factor that facilitates this illegal trade. There are other underlying factors such as inequalities that exist between source and destination countries and conflicts among others. Such weaknesses of migration business theory exclude it from predicting or explaining in a holistic manner the concept of migrants smuggling and trafficking in persons that this study sought to explore.

2.5 Conceptual Framework

The dependent variable for this study is human trafficking while the independent variables are the different policies that touch on migration in Kenya and factors that contribute to human trafficking. The relationship between these variables is presented in a hypothetical framework as shown below;
2.6 Summary of Literature Review

It is evident that the government of Kenya is willing to formalize a policy framework to manage migration. This is from the various migration policies adopted. However, the integration of migration policies into development plans is limited and the implementation of these policies suffer lack of capacity. The refugee population is quite a challenge especially when tracking and
monitoring them. The lack of adequate information on their numbers makes it difficult to effectively implement the migration policies.

The country has committed itself by being part of international treaties and legislations that relate to migration. Kenya’s previous dualist legal system required that international treaties and obligations be implemented after domestic legislation had been done. This was due to the significant procrastinations in the implementation of treaties as the creation of new laws and amendments on the existing once has led to recurrent national debates. Few studies have conducted to analyze any contribution of the migration policies on human trafficking and smuggling in the country and more specifically Garissa County. This study therefore aims at assessing the contribution of the migration policy on human trafficking in Garissa since it is one of the routes for traffickers.
CHAPTER THREE
RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.0 Introduction

This chapter describes procedures that were used in conducting the research. The topics covered include; research design, site of the study, the target population, sampling techniques and sample size, data collection, data analysis, data management and ethical considerations.

3.1 Research Design

This study used a descriptive survey design. According to Kothari, (2004) descriptive research studies are studies that focus on describing the features of a specific group or individual. This research design therefore will be very helpful in obtaining information from the respondents on their views on the efficacy of the migration policy in talking human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border. To get this information, the researcher administered questionnaires to the selected participants and also conducted interviews with several persons in Garissa County that is, Immigration Officers, Police Officers, Judiciary and victims of human trafficking. Qualitative and quantitative data complemented each other in the study.

3.2 Study Variables

The independent variable in this study is the different policies that have a look at the migration policy and effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking. The dependent variable is the issue of human trafficking. The study essentially looked at how the migration policy impact on human trafficking.
3.3 Site of the Study

The study was conducted at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa town, Garissa County. This is the north-eastern point of entry, transit and exit.

3.4 Target Population

The target population for this study comprised of immigration officers, prosecutors, judges and police officers (Anti-Terrorism Police Unit) in Garissa. This included a population of 152 individuals from which a sample of 113 was selected.

3.5 Sampling Techniques and Sample Size

Sampling refers to the process of selecting a representative part of the population. Respondents for this study were selected using purposive sampling technique. Respondents were selected from four groups that is; immigration officers who have the mandate to control migrants entering, transiting or leaving Kenya; police officers from Anti-Terrorism Police Unit who intercept and investigate foreigners arrested in Kenya; prosecutors who handle cases of smuggled and trafficked foreigners arrested in the country and judges who hear cases of smuggled and trafficked foreigners arrested in Kenya for determination.

The sample size determination followed the sampling table format, adopted from Krejcie and Morgan, 1970. This is because the exact numbers of the population are known. The sampling frame is shown below.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadre</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Sample Proportion</th>
<th>Sample</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Immigration officers</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosecutors</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police officers (ATPU)</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>82.2</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judges/magistrates</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thus, for a population of 152, the sample of 113 study participants were used, that is, a study population of 152 with a sample of 113. The participants were distributed across the four cadres according to the number of professionals in each cadre. Therefore, 20 immigration officers, 2 prosecutors, 3 judges/magistrates and 88 ATPU were selected. These are individuals who handle matters of human trafficking.

3.6 Research Instruments

There are several tools used for data collection. They include questionnaires which could either have structured or closed questions or unstructured or open ended questions, (Mugenda & Mugenda, 2010). The questionnaires can be filled by the respondents or the researcher. Interviews are another way of data collection where the researcher has to meet face-to-face with
respondents. Observation is another method where the researcher just observes and does nothing to influence the outcome of the study, (Mugenda & Mugenda, 2010). Making sketches or recordings is necessary in this method.

Primary and secondary data were used in this study. Secondary sources comprised of data from journal articles, security and policy documents, reports, books and newspaper articles. The data collected tracked the cases of human trafficking reported before the policy was enacted and after enactment. This was possible for establishing the impact brought about by the migration policy. A semi-structured questionnaire was administered to immigration officers, prosecutors, police officers and judges. The questionnaires were administered using drop and pick later method. This method is preferred due to the busy schedules of the targeted respondents and high response rate that is needed. The researcher also employed face-to-face method to interview security experts who provided in-depth information on migration and human trafficking.

3.7 Pilot study

Pilot studies are small-scale, preliminary studies which are aimed at investigating whether critical components of the main study would be feasible. Piloting was conducted using 10 ATPU officers (10% sample) in Garissa County. Care was taken so that subjects do not form part of actual data collection.

3.8 Validity and Reliability

Validity is concerned with the extent to which an empirical measure or numerous measures of a concept correctly represent that concept (Neuman, 2006). It is all about how accurate the data
represents the variables of the study. Validity of the instruments was done by subjecting the questionnaire to expert review by the university supervisors. Mugenda and Mugenda (2010), define reliability as a measure of the extent to which a research tool yields reliable results or data after recurring trials. The split half test was used to test for reliability of the instruments in this study. Half of the questions on the test were chosen randomly and the result compared with other half and if there is a significant positive connection between two halves, then the results were deemed reliable.

3.9 Data collection procedures

Data was collected with permission from the university and National Commission for Science Technology and Innovation (NACOSTI) and also an appointment was arranged for questionnaires administration to the respondents. Both closed and open-ended questions were used in data collection, chronologically arranged with a view to match code and variable. Apart from the use of questionnaires, which include the interview guide and the main questionnaire, an observation guide was also used to collect the necessary information. For accuracy of the filled questionnaires and for purposes of ensuring comprehensiveness, the data collected was cleaned as it could be prone to errors.

3.10 Data analysis

Analysis of quantitative data was done using descriptive statistics by the help of SPSS version 23. From Mugenda and Mugenda (2010), they describe descriptive statistics as “one that involves the process of computing a mass of raw data into charts, tables, with frequency distribution and percentages”. Qualitative data was analysed in themes. According to Brann and
Clerke (2006), “thematic analysis is a technique for classifying and analyzing themes (patterns) in a given data. It looks across the entire data to identify the key themes and generate a summary of all the views gathered”.

3.10.1 Data Management

This refers to the process where data is organized and maintained in order to meet the on-going information cycle. Matters of data quality are of importance here and handling of data was put into consideration.

3.10.2 Ethical Consideration

The study supports goals such as truth, knowledge, and evasion of errors for example miss-interpreting the research data. Because research involves great deals of coordination and cooperation amongst lots of different people, the ethical standards help to promote the values that are vital to teamwork such as, accountability and trust. To get collaboration from respondents, the researcher obtained permission from NACOSTI. Respondents were guaranteed of confidentiality of the information collected and that the data was only used for academic purposes only. The respondents were also assured that the information provided was used to victimize or undermine anybody.
CHAPTER FOUR
DATA ANALYSIS, PRESENTATION AND INTERPRETATION

4.1 Introduction
The present study set out to investigate the impact the migration policy in Kenya on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa town, Garissa County. More specifically, the study sought to ascertain the effects of migration policies on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County; determine the effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County; and to assess the challenges that affect the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County.

4.1.1 Response Rate
The study achieved a response rate of 80.5% with 91 respondents reached, out of the 113 targeted. This is considered adequate for analysis and reporting by Mugenda and Mugenda (2010). Findings are tabulated in table 4.1.

Table 4.1 Response Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questionnaires</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reached</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>80.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unreached</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distributed</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1.2 Reliability Test Results

To check for reliability, the Cronbach’s alpha test was employed. According to Tashakkori and Teddlie (2012), if the Cronbach’s alpha is less than 0.6, it implies that the instrument used has a low reliability. However, if the alpha value is at least 0.7, the instrument is considered reliable. Further, to ensure the validity of the instrument, the Supervisor’s input and corrections regarding the various items in the questionnaire were done. Table 4.2 presents the reliability test results.

Table 4.2 Cronbach's Alpha Coefficients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Cronbach's Alpha</th>
<th>Number of Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Migration Policies</td>
<td>0.819</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio Economic Factors</td>
<td>0.800</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges</td>
<td>0.802</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Coefficients Alpha Coefficients in Table 4.2 reveal that all the scales were significant, having an alpha coefficient above the prescribed threshold of 0.7. The highest level of reliability was recorded in Migration Policies with 12 items (α=0.819) followed by Challenges (α=0.802) with 10 items. Socio Economic Factors with 11 items was also reliable at an Alpha coefficient of 0.800. The study thus found that the data collection instruments were reliable and could thus be used for analysis.
4.2 Background Information

This section captures the responses by gender, age, qualifications, and work experience as well as job cadre. Responses are given in frequencies and percentages and presented in tables and figures.

4.2.1 Response by Gender

In order to show the gender distribution and parity across the institutions included in the survey, the study sought to determine the respondents’ gender. Respondents were thus required to indicate by checking either male or female response categories provided. Results are presented in table 4.3.

Table 4.3 Response by Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>67.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>32.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As presented in table 4.3, male respondents, 67.1%, registered the majority as compared to their female counterparts, 32.9%. It follows then from the findings, that the males made the dominant gender in the study. Female respondents were however also adequately represented, implying that responses from both genders are represented in the study. The findings indicate a gender disparity in the Kenyan labor market, with more males as compared to females. This is in agreement with Okumu (2009) who notes that gender disparities in employment opportunities and economic investment patterns in Kenya have continued to widen across all sectors of the economy and at various levels of development intervention.

4.2.2 Response by Age

The study deemed age an important demographic characteristic in the present study with a view to establish any pertinent trends in the variables under study as well as to have an overview of the age distribution thereof. Figure 4.1 presents the findings.

![Figure 4.1 Response by Age](image-url)
Results as illustrated in figure 4.1 reveal that a majority of respondents (38.6%) were between 36 and 44 years of age, followed by 26.2% aged between 25 and 35 years while 22.9% fall between 45 - 54 years age category. Only 9.2% and 3.1% were found to fall either below 25 years or above 54 years of age. As such, it can be deduced that age, across the respondents reached was majorly youthful to middle age, with a majority being between 25 and 54 years of age. This is however in contrast with Coenjaerts, Ernst, Firtuny and Rei (2009) who argues that youth unemployment rates are several times higher than middle age rates and particularly high in far flung areas of North and North Eastern regions.

4.2.3 Response by Qualifications

Respondents were also asked to indicate their respective levels of education. This would serve to show the literacy levels among the respondents with regard to education, as well as a general overview of education levels among respondents. Findings are as shown in Figure 4.2.

![Figure 4.2 Response by Qualifications](image-url)
From the findings in Figure 4.2, a majority of respondents (36.7%) indicated having attained a Diploma level, followed by 31.1% having a Bachelor’s Degree while 26.5% had reached a Certificate level. The finding is of the implication that over a half of the respondents had low above tertiary education, most having Diplomas and Degrees. Accordingly, Gelderman et al. (2006) argue that staff education and training on the concept of self-efficacy, competence and perceived service quality is of utmost significance among officers in internal security dockets. Thus, they argue, provides the predictor on how well security entities are progressing towards predetermined objectives with the goal of initiating performance improvements.

4.2.4 Response by Work Experience

As some adequate length of experience by respondents was necessary in establishing the study objectives, respondents were asked to indicate the number of years they have worked in their respective positions. Figure 4.3 illustrates the findings.

Figure 4.3 Length of Service
As illustrated in figure 4.3, a majority of respondents (53.1%) have been working in their respective stations for between 5 and 10 years. This was distantly followed by 27.6% having worked for between 1 and 5 years then 20.3% who have worked for over 10 years. The results reveal a rather fairly distribution across the years representing the length of work experience among the respondents reached, indicating that a majority of respondents reached are richly experienced, with a majority having worked for over 5 years. This is in line with Wanyama (2010) who concludes that security officers’ job experience is crucial in ensuring that all actions in respect of the providing security, including proper selection of the strategy, evaluation criteria and solving security concerns are strategically carried out in an effort to enhance human security.

4.2.5 Response by Job Cadre

Respondents were asked to indicate their respective occupations with a view to further ascertain representation and diversity thereof in perspectives. Figure 4.4 presents the results.

![Figure 4.4 Response by Job Cadre](image.png)
Results illustrated in figure 4.4 above revealed that a majority of respondents reached (77.2%) were Police Officers (ATPU), distantly followed by Immigration Officers represented by 16.5% of the respondents Judges/Magistrates and Prosecutors recorded the least, at 4.0% and 2.3% respectively. This indicates the diverse perspectives as informed by tasks and duties characteristic of the respective positions. This is in agreement with Edler and Georghiou (2007) who provide that diverse expertise is paramount in addressing various security provision challenges and to provide oversight function, a key component of the broader set of management controls that are used to ensure the sound management of human security functions.

### 4.2.6 Extent of Human Trafficking Cases

Respondents were asked to indicate the prevalence with which human trafficking cases occurred in the study area. This would indicate the extent to which the scourge is experienced across the Kenya-Somalia border. Findings are as indicated in figure 4.5.

![Figure 4.5 Extent of Human Trafficking Cases](image-url)
Figure 4.5 reveals that a majority of respondents consider the cases of human trafficking in the study area as fairly widespread (32.2%), closely followed by 29.5% considering the same as very widespread while 20.8% were not aware. Only 14.3% are over the view that human trafficking in the study area is not widespread.

Asked in an interview on the extent to which human trafficking is present at the Kenya-Somalia Border, responses concurred with the foregoing finding, indicating that human trafficking was fairly widespread in the study area. An interview for instance commented that:

“…..Human trafficking cases are quite widespread in Kenya especially across the Kenya-Somalia Border. Most perpetrators are illegal immigrants into the country in collaboration with Kenyan citizens but out officers have been successful in bringing quite a number to book…….”

Interview with an Immigration Officer

Asked in an interview on who the victims of domestic human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border are, it emerged that the youth, women and children constituted a majority of the victims. An interview noted that:

“….. A majority of human trafficking victims are unsuspecting, desperate jobless youth as well as vulnerable groups including uneducated women and young girls…..”

Interview with a police officer

The foregoing findings are of the implication that human trafficking cases in the study area are considerably widespread, with most victims including unsuspecting, desperate jobless youth as well as vulnerable groups including uneducated women and children.

4.3 Migration Policies

The study sought to ascertain the effects of migration policies on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. To this end, respondents were asked to indicate their
respective levels of agreement with a set of statements posed to the effect of migration policies and their effects on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. Results are presented in table 4.4.

Table 4.4 Migration Policies and Human Trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compliance</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Existing migration policies are not deterrent enough to warrant compliance</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>1.390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are low awareness levels of the existing migration policies hence</td>
<td>4.08</td>
<td>1.108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>low compliance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is lack of clarity on human trafficking in the existing migration</td>
<td>3.42</td>
<td>1.324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>policies which limits compliance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enforcement</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Std. Dev</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discrepancies in the existing migration policies make it difficult to</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>1.447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prosecute offenders</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is lack of sufficient manpower for effective implementation of the</td>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>1.335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>existing migration policies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is lack of political will which inhibits effective arrests and</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>1.222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prosecution of traffickers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appraisal</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Std. Dev</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The existing policies are not periodically reviewed hence continued</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>.888</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is lack of policy analysis prior to enactment hence ineffectiveness</td>
<td>3.97</td>
<td>1.218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in curbing human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short comings in existing policies are not taken up and addressed hence</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>1.301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>continued ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Std. Dev</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The existing policies and legislation are not aimed at combating the</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>1.274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>underlying causes of human trafficking hence continuity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is lack of community participation in human trafficking policy</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>1.301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>formulation hence irrelevance of some provisions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some existing policies are domesticated from international laws and</td>
<td>3.86</td>
<td>1.222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>policies without contextualizing the crime and its causes locally hence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ineffectiveness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As presented in table 4.4, with regard to compliance, a majority of respondents highly agrees that there are low awareness levels of the existing migration policies hence low compliance (4.08); and that existing migration policies are not deterrent enough to warrant compliance (3.76). A majority however only moderately agrees that there is lack of clarity on human trafficking in the existing migration policies which limits compliance (3.42). On enforcement, a majority of respondents highly agrees that there is lack of sufficient manpower for effective implementation of the existing migration policies (4.16); and that there is lack of political will which inhibits effective arrests and prosecution of traffickers (4.00). A majority however only moderately agrees that discrepancies in the existing migration policies make it difficult to prosecute offenders (3.45). With regard to appraisal, a majority of respondents highly agrees that the existing policies are not periodically reviewed hence continued ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking (4.14); there is lack of policy analysis prior to enactment hence ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking (3.97); and that shortcomings in existing policies are not taken up and addressed hence continued ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking (3.75). Further on relevance, a majority of respondents highly agrees that some existing policies are domesticated from international laws and policies without contextualizing the crime and its causes locally hence ineffectiveness (3.86); the existing policies and legislation are not aimed at combating the underlying causes of human trafficking hence continuity (3.85); and that there is lack of community participation in human trafficking policy formulation hence irrelevance of some provisions (3.82);

The study further probed to find out how respondents would rate compliance with the migration policies especially with regard to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border. A
majority in this regard rated compliance as mainly poor, attributing it to low awareness levels, insufficient resources to enable effective enforcement, impunity and corruption as well as lack of political will. Respondents were also asked to describe the enforcement capacity in dealing with human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border, to which it was established that lack of enough enforcement officers and capacity building for both policies officers and members of the judiciary including prosecutors and magistrates contribute most to weak enforcement capacity. Asked on how relevant the migration policies were in curbing human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border, a majority considered in relevant which could be effective, were the challenges in their implementation addressed.

 Asked to mention the available policies that handle migration as applied in the county, it was established that some of the pertinent policies include the Kenya Vision 2030, National Diaspora Policy, National Migration Policy and National Labor Migration Policy. Asked on how effective extant policies have been in curbing human trafficking in the country, respondents indicated that the policies were fairly effective, which can be improved should the foregoing challenges be addressed.

 It can be deduced from the foregoing findings that whereas there exist clear and well laid out migration policies, they have not been significantly effective in curbing human trafficking in the study area, owing to a variety of inadequacies in their formulation, enactment and execution. These include among others: poor enforcement capacity due to insufficient manpower; lacking periodic policies analyses and reviews; low awareness levels; lack of political will; domestication of polices from international laws and policies without contextualizing the crime;
underlying causes of human trafficking are not addressed in the existing policies and legislation; and lack of community participation in the policy formulation.

The findings are in agreement with Farr (2015) who argues that factors such as firm government buy-in as well as the absence of political will and resources play a part in the sluggishness. Convincing research, inspiring action plans and proposed partnerships and frameworks all look great on paper, but failure to implement results in zero gains marked by significantly low compliance levels (Farr, 2015). The findings also agree with Feingold (2015) who offers that unfortunately, the absence of clarity, agreement and facts on human trafficking as well as considerably low awareness levels of the crime compounds human trafficking policy formulation and compliance challenges. Accordingly, Belser (2016) offers that awareness-raising campaigns and programmes must be carried out in a country’s principal language to effectively inform individuals, media, communities, and law enforcement agencies. Similarly, Esquibel (2015) argues that awareness and sensitivity training should be done to all the relevant stakeholders including magistrates, law enforcement and all the relevant government departments.

4.4 Socio-economic Factors

The study sought to determine the effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. To this end, respondents were asked to indicate their respective levels of agreement with a set of statements posed to the effect of socio economic factors and their effect on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. Findings are as presented in table 4.5.
Table 4.5 Socio-economic Factors and Human Trafficking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Socio-economic Factors</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Porous Borders</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of a strict border regulation and enactment of existing policies and legislation perpetuate human trafficking</td>
<td>3.98</td>
<td>.6580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compromised law enforcers make it easy to carry out human trafficking across the borders</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>.6108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is inadequate international cooperation which weakens border control</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>.8762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is inadequate capacity to detect and curb human trafficking on the part of border control agencies hence perpetuating the crime</td>
<td>4.19</td>
<td>.6436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Political Instability and Ethnic Tensions</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political conflicts disrupt security procedures, including border controls and protection weakening law enforcement and enabling human trafficking</td>
<td>3.81</td>
<td>.9607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internally displaced persons or refugees provide a greater supply of people to become trafficked</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>.7554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large population flows as a result of conflicts and ethnic tensions reduce state capacity which exacerbate governance, promoting more instability, and ultimately human trafficking</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>.9660</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Stability</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty pushes people to seek new labor opportunities abroad which provides avenues for human trafficking</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>.9703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of job opportunities and a promise of well-paying jobs abroad perpetuates human trafficking</td>
<td>4.09</td>
<td>.7225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of empowerment of women and vulnerable groups exacerbates human trafficking</td>
<td>4.14</td>
<td>.888</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial, agricultural or commercial pursuits that rely on impoverished individuals being trafficked illegally promote human trafficking</td>
<td>3.67</td>
<td>1.218</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As presented in table 4.5 above, with regard to Porous Borders, a majority of respondents affirm that compromised law enforcers make it easy to carry out human trafficking across the borders (4.19); there is inadequate capacity to detect and curb human trafficking on the part of border control agencies hence perpetuating the crime (4.19); lack of a strict border regulation and enactment of existing policies and legislation perpetuate human trafficking (3.98); and that there is inadequate international cooperation which weakens border control (3.85). With regard to
Political Instability and Ethnic Tensions, a majority of respondents affirms that internally displaced persons or refugees provide a greater supply of people to become trafficked (4.17); ultimately human trafficking (3.91); and that large population flows as a result of conflicts and ethnic tensions reduce state capacity which exacerbate governance, promoting more instability, and political conflicts disrupt security procedures, including border controls and protection weakening law enforcement and enabling human trafficking (3.81). Lastly on Economic Stability, a majority of respondents affirms that lack of empowerment of women and vulnerable groups exacerbates human trafficking (4.14); poverty pushes people to seek new labor opportunities abroad which provides avenues for human trafficking (4.14); lack of job opportunities and a promise of well-paying jobs abroad perpetuates human trafficking (4.09); and that industrial, agricultural or commercial pursuits that rely on impoverished individuals being trafficked illegally promote human trafficking (3.67).

The study further probed respondents’ opinion on how effective border control has been in curbing human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border. It was found out to this end that whereas personnel tasked with border control were doing their best to curb human trafficking, a myriad of factors are in play that render their efforts not adequately effective. A majority of respondents cited lack of a strict border regulation, compromised law enforcers and inadequate capacity to detect and curb human trafficking as prominent among these factors.

Respondents were further asked to comment on how in their experience, political instability and ethnic tensions have contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border. It was established in this regard that internally displaced persons and refugees as a result of political
instability and ethnic tensions provide a greater supply of people to become trafficked. Respondents were also asked to comment on how in their experience, economic stability has contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border. Respondents indicated to this end that poverty, lack of job opportunities, a promise of well-paying jobs abroad as well as lack of empowerment of women and vulnerable groups all contribute towards increase in human trafficking.

The study also sought to find out in an interview, the main factors contributing to domestic human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, to which it was established that unemployment and corruption were the most significant. An interviewee observed that:

“….The main factor contributing to domestic human trafficking is joblessness, whereby unsuspecting Kenyans are promised good jobs abroad…..”

Interview with an Immigration Officer

The foregoing findings are of the implication that various socio-economic factors constitute the underlying factors and are responsible for increasing human trafficking cases across the Kenya-Somalia border, as well as inhibiting enforcement efforts to curb the same. These include corruption among immigration and law enforcers; inadequacy among border control agencies to detect and curb human trafficking at the border; political conflicts and ethnic tensions producing internally displaced persons and refugees who provide a greater supply of people to become trafficked; lack of empowerment of women and vulnerable groups; unemployment and poverty as well as lack of a strict border regulation and enactment of existing policies and legislation.

The finding is in tandem with Europol (2014) which attributes human trafficking to the desperation of individuals who are gullible to the deception that better jobs and plenty employment opportunities lie in wait for them abroad, only to end up human trafficking victims. The Kenya National Crime Research Centre (2014) reports that the most trafficked through the
Kenya border, most notoriously Moyale and exits through Namanga border to South Africa are Ethiopians escaping lack of employment and political persecution. The findings are also in agreement with Salehyan and Gleditsch (2016) who report that during conflict, migratory channels assist in establishing rebel social networks. This supports Grant (2012) who found a link between migrant workers, refugees and human trafficking, which suggest that in either autocratic or corrupt nations, or in countries with low risk for punishment, traffickers may have sanctuaries afforded to them. According to Shelley (2014), people are more vulnerable to being trafficked when they are more desperate to find new opportunities.

4.5 Challenges in the Implementation of Migration Policy

The study finally sought to assess the challenges that affect the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. To this end, respondents were asked to indicate their respective levels of agreement with a set of statements posed to the effect of challenges affecting the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. Table 4.6 below presents the findings.
### Table 4.6 Challenges in the Implementation of Migration Policy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Corruption</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impunity within pertinent law enforcement agencies promotes a lack of accountability among enforcement officers which enables human trafficking</td>
<td>4.06</td>
<td>1.390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bribery of officials at the borders promotes human trafficking</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>1.108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vested interests among high ranking officials facilitate trafficking circuits in the country</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>1.324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corruption undermines efforts to combat human trafficking, and leaves victims terrified, unable to seek assistance from law enforcement or other state institutions</td>
<td>3.95</td>
<td>1.447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technology</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Users of social networking sites (SNS) disclose information about themselves, knowingly or unknowingly which is instrumental in the recruitment and exploitation of trafficked persons</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td>1.335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Due to technical advances, such as location tracking, and the openness of many SNS, it is possible for traffickers to gain a wide pool of data on trafficked persons</td>
<td>3.13</td>
<td>1.229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to adult entertainment sites, online dating sites, peer to peer networks promote human trafficking for sexual exploitation</td>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>1.237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human Resource Capacity</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate allocation of resources for better enforcement, awareness, and victim services enable the continuity of human trafficking</td>
<td>3.90</td>
<td>1.257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of training of police, government officials and service providers weakness enforcement capacity</td>
<td>3.92</td>
<td>1.306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law enforcement agencies in the country do not have protocols to investigate human trafficking cases</td>
<td>3.35</td>
<td>1.254</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Findings presented in table 4.6 indicate that with regard to **Corruption**, a majority of respondents agrees that impunity within pertinent law enforcement agencies promotes a lack of accountability among enforcement officers which enables human trafficking (4.06); bribery of officials at the borders promotes human trafficking (4.18); corruption undermines efforts to combat human trafficking, and leaves victims terrified, unable to seek assistance from law enforcement or other state institutions (3.95); and that vested interests among high ranking officials facilitate trafficking circuits in the country (3.92). With regard to **Technology**, a **majority of respondents** only moderately agrees that users of social networking sites (SNS)
disclose information about themselves, knowingly or unknowingly which is instrumental in the recruitment and exploitation of trafficked persons (3.36); due to technical advances, such as location tracking, and the openness of many SNS, it is possible for traffickers to gain a wide pool of data on trafficked persons (3.13); and that access to adult entertainment sites, online dating sites, peer to peer networks promote human trafficking for sexual exploitation (3.23). With regard to Human Resource Capacity, a majority of respondents highly agrees that lack of training of police, government officials and service providers weakness enforcement capacity (3.92); inadequate allocation of resources for better enforcement, awareness, and victim services enable the continuity of human trafficking (3.90); and that law enforcement agencies in the country do not have protocols to investigate human trafficking cases (3.35).

The study probed to find out how in respondents’ experience, corruption has contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border. It was established in this regard that impunity within pertinent law enforcement agencies, bribery of officials at the borders as well as vested interests among high ranking officials facilitate trafficking circuits in the country. Respondents were also asked to indicate how in their experience, technology contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border. Respondents in this regard indicated that SNS disclose information about potential victims which aids criminals in executing the crime and that such sites as recruitment and online dating promote human trafficking for sexual exploitation. This was consistent with findings in an interview on the challenges faced in preventing and combating Human Trafficking in Kenya, to which respondents cited inadequate enforcement capacity, inadequate allocation of resources for better enforcement, awareness, and victim services, corruption which includes impunity within and bribery of officials as well as vested interests among high ranking officials.
It can be deduced from the foregoing findings that a myriad of challenges hamper efforts to implementation migration policies in the country, with a view to curb human trafficking. Most pronounced among these include: impunity within pertinent law enforcement agencies; bribery of officials at the borders promotes human trafficking; vested interests among high ranking officials; lack of training of police, government officials and service; as well as inadequate allocation of resources for better enforcement, awareness, and victim services.

The finding is consistent with Mendelson (2015) who asserts that corruption and human trafficking are indisputably linked. Mendelson (2015) suggests a strong relationship between the two, hence concluding that countries with high levels of institutional corruption are more likely to have high levels of human trafficking within their borders. Accordingly, Shelley (2014) notes that trafficking ‘hot spots’ correlate to regions with perceived impunity for public corruption. This is further supported by the OECD’s comparison of the US TIP Report 2014 with Transparency International’s 2014 Corruption Perception Index. This comparison indicated a marked overlap amongst countries classified as having a critical human trafficking dilemma and countries perceived as experiencing serious corruption. The findings are further in agreement with Mbeo and Sambo (2011) argue that bribery is another key means by which public officials use their position to facilitate – and to profit from – human trafficking. Hewson (2010) adds that “users of SNS disclose information about themselves, unknowingly or knowingly.” it can take place in a Facebook post, when posting a tweet, checking in at a hotel via TripAdvisor or uploading a picture to Instagram. It is possible for traffickers, due to technical improvements, such as the openness of numerous SNS and location tracking, to gain a wide pool of data on trafficked persons.
CHAPTER FIVE
SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Introduction
In this chapter, the summary of key findings, conclusions, recommendations and suggestions for further research are presented.

5.2 Summary of Key Findings
The study sought to ascertain the effects of migration policies on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. It was found that a majority of respondents highly agrees that there is lack of sufficient manpower for effective implementation of the existing migration policies (4.16); the existing policies are not periodically reviewed hence continued ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking (4.14); there are low awareness levels of the existing migration policies hence low compliance (4.08); there is lack of political will which inhibits effective arrests and prosecution of traffickers (4.00); there is lack of policy analysis prior to enactment hence ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking (3.97); some existing policies are domesticated from international laws and policies without contextualizing the crime and its causes locally hence ineffectiveness (3.86); the existing policies and legislation are not aimed at combating the underlying causes of human trafficking hence continuity (3.85); and that there is lack of community participation in human trafficking policy formulation hence irrelevance of some provisions.

The study sought to determine the effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. A majority of respondents affirms in this regard that
compromised law enforcers make is easy to carry out human trafficking across the borders (4.19); there is inadequate capacity to detect and curb human trafficking on the part of border control agencies hence perpetuating the crime (4.19); internally displaced persons or refugees provide a greater supply of people to become trafficked (4.17); lack of empowerment of women and vulnerable groups exacerbates human trafficking (4.14); poverty pushes people to seek new labor opportunities abroad which provides avenues for human trafficking (4.14); lack of job opportunities and a promise of well-paying jobs abroad perpetuates human trafficking (4.09); lack of a strict border regulation and enactment of existing policies and legislation perpetuate human trafficking (3.98); large population flows as a result of conflicts and ethnic tensions reduce state capacity which exacerbate governance, promoting more instability, and ultimately human trafficking (3.91); there is inadequate international cooperation which weakens border control (3.85); political conflicts disrupt security procedures, including border controls and protection weakening law enforcement and enabling human trafficking (3.81); and that industrial, agricultural or commercial pursuits that rely on impoverished individuals being trafficked illegally promote human trafficking (3.67).

The study finally sought to assess the challenges that affect the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. Findings indicate that a majority of respondents agrees that impunity within pertinent law enforcement agencies promotes a lack of accountability among enforcement officers which enables human trafficking (4.06); bribery of officials at the borders promotes human trafficking (4.18); corruption undermines efforts to combat human trafficking, and leaves victims terrified, unable to seek assistance from law enforcement or other state institutions (3.95); vested interests among high
ranking officials facilitate trafficking circuits in the country (3.92); lack of training of police, government officials and service providers weakness enforcement capacity (3.92); inadequate allocation of resources for better enforcement, awareness, and victim services enable the continuity of human trafficking (3.90).

5.3 Conclusion

From the foregoing findings, it can be deduced that whereas there exist clear and well laid out migration policies, they have not been significantly effective in curbing human trafficking in the study area, owing to a variety of inadequacies in their formulation, enactment and execution. These include among others: poor enforcement capacity due to insufficient manpower; lacking periodic policies analyses and reviews; low awareness levels; lack of political will; domestication of polices from international laws and policies without contextualizing the crime; underlying causes of human trafficking are not addressed in the existing policies and legislation; and lack of community participation in the policy formulation.

It can also be deduced from the findings that various socio-economic factors constitute the underlying factors and are responsible for increasing human trafficking cases across the Kenya-Somalia border, as well as inhibiting enforcement efforts to curb the same. These include corruption among immigration and law enforcers; inadequacy among border control agencies to detect and curb human trafficking at the border; political conflicts and ethnic tensions producing internally displaced persons and refugees who provide a greater supply of people to become trafficked; lack of empowerment of women and vulnerable groups; unemployment and poverty as well as lack of a strict border regulation and enactment of existing policies and legislation.
The findings further imply that a myriad of challenges hamper efforts to implementation migration policies in the country, with a view to curb human trafficking. Most pronounced among these include: impunity within pertinent law enforcement agencies; bribery of officials at the borders promotes human trafficking; vested interests among high ranking officials; lack of training of police, government officials and service; as well as inadequate allocation of resources for better enforcement, awareness, and victim services.

5.4 Recommendations

From the foregoing findings and subsequent conclusions, the following recommendations are made:

Both the national government of Kenya and County governments should work to create employment opportunities for both skilled and unskilled Kenyans to offer them better and more attractive opportunities than ones offered by the human traffickers.

There is need for stakeholders in the fight against human trafficking to embrace new technologies in tracking and detecting the traffickers as well as the practice by establishing an inter-link between local and international investigating agencies in addition to enhancing training of investigators.

There is also need to raise the awareness of potential victims about human trafficking and the relevant policies and legislations in order to avoid falling victims to the scourge.

There is need for the National Police Service to strengthen detection and investigation process so as to stem out impunity and corruption which hampers investigation and prosecution efforts.
Accordingly, there is need for the director of public prosecution to investigation top ranking officials with vested interests in human trafficking and take stern action against perpetrators.

The government of Kenya should also strengthen oversight over overseas job recruitment agencies to ensure innocent Kenyans do not end up victims of human trafficking.

5.5 Suggestions for Further Studies

The present study has investigated the impact of migration policy in Kenya on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa town, Garissa County. It is hereby suggested that future studies explore the same in relation to other migratory channels in order to establish any pertinent trends and patterns. Future studies may also focus on the role played by overseas job recruitment agencies in human trafficking in Kenya.
REFERENCES


Akaha, T. (2011). Human security in East Asia: Embracing global norms through regional cooperation in human trafficking, labour migration, and HIV. J. Hum, Secur, 5 page 11-34


Kerry, S. et al. (2012). Determinants of HIV in key hotspots on the southern transport corridors: Maputo to Swaziland. IOM and UNDP. Maputo.


APPENDICES

A1: Study’s Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time/activities</th>
<th>May 18</th>
<th>June 18</th>
<th>July 18</th>
<th>Aug 18</th>
<th>Sep 18</th>
<th>Oct 18</th>
<th>Nov 18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concept and presentation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing research proposal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission of proposal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data collection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data analysis and project report writing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission of report</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A2: Budget for the study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stationery</td>
<td>120 questionnaires</td>
<td>@ sh.100</td>
<td>Sh.12000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposal and Report printing, binding</td>
<td>3 copies report, 2 copies proposal</td>
<td>@ sh.1000</td>
<td>Sh. 5000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flash disk</td>
<td></td>
<td>@ sh.1200</td>
<td>Sh. 1200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travelling cost</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sh.7500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lunch during data collection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sh.7500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous costs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sh. 10000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Sh. 43,200</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A3.1: Questionnaire

Section A: Background information

Please indicate your gender.

a) Male.
b) Female.

What is your age bracket?

a) Below 25 years.
b) 25-35 years.
c) 45-54 years.
d) Over 54 years.

What are your qualifications?

a) Certificate.
b) Diploma
c) Degree
d) Masters
e) Others.

What is your work experience?

a) 1-5 years.
b) 5-10 years.
c) 10+ years

What is your job cadre?

a) Immigration officer
b) Prosecutor  
c) Police officer (ATPU)  
d) Judge/magistrate  
a) Do not occur  
b) Not widespread  
c) Fairly widespread  
d) Very widespread  
e) Very widespread  
f) Don’t know

**PART B: MIGRATION POLICIES**

1. Following is a list of questions designed to gather information relating to the effects of migration policies on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. Please consider each statement carefully to determine how you feel about the subject matter.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compliance</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Existing migration policies are not deterrent enough to warrant compliance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are low awareness levels of the existing migration policies hence low compliance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is lack of clarity on human trafficking in the existing migration policies which limits compliance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Enforcement**

| Discrepancies in the existing migration policies make it difficult to prosecute offenders |   |   |   |   |   |
| There is lack of sufficient manpower for effective                           |   |   |   |   |   |
There is lack of political will which inhibits effective arrests and prosecution of traffickers

**Appraisal**

The existing policies are not periodically reviewed hence continued ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking

There is lack of policy analysis prior to enactment hence ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking

Short comings in existing policies are not taken up and addressed hence continued ineffectiveness in curbing human trafficking

**Relevance**

The existing policies and legislation are not aimed at combating the underlying causes of human trafficking hence continuity

There is lack of community participation in human trafficking policy formulation hence irrelevance of some provisions

Some existing policies are domesticated from international laws and policies without contextualizing the crime and its causes locally hence ineffectiveness

---

2. In your experience, how would you rate compliance with the migration policies especially with regard to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate

3. How would you describe the enforcement capacity in dealing with human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate

4. Are the policies periodically reviewed for improvements? Please elaborate

5. In your opinion, how relevant are the migration policies in curbing human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate
PART C: SOCIO ECONOMIC FACTORS

Following is a list of questions designed to gather information relating to the effects of socio economic factors on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. Please consider each statement carefully to determine how you feel about the subject matter.

PLEASE RESPOND TO ALL THE QUESTIONS USING THE FOLLOWING SCALE:
1 = Strongly Disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly Agree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Porous Borders</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of a strict border regulation and enactment of existing policies and legislation perpetuate human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compromised law enforcers make it easy to carry out human trafficking across the borders</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is inadequate international cooperation which weakens border control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is inadequate capacity to detect and curb human trafficking on the part of border control agencies hence perpetuating the crime</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political Instability and Ethnic Tensions</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political conflicts disrupt security procedures, including border controls and protection weakening law enforcement and enabling human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internally displaced persons or refugees provide a greater supply of people to become trafficked</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large population flows as a result of conflicts and ethnic tensions reduce state capacity which exacerbates governance, promoting more instability, and ultimately human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Stability</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty pushes people to seek new labor opportunities abroad which provides avenues for human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of job opportunities and a promise of well-paying jobs abroad perpetuates human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of empowerment of women and vulnerable groups exacerbates human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial, agricultural or commercial pursuits that rely on impoverished individuals being trafficked illegally promote human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. In your experience, how effective has border control been in curbing human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate

2. In your experience, how have political instability and ethnic tensions contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate

3. In your experience, how has economic stability contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate

PART D: CHALLENGES IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MIGRATION POLICY

Following is a list of questions designed to gather information relating to the challenges that affect the implementation of the migration policy on human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border, Garissa County. Please consider each statement carefully to determine how you feel about the subject matter.

PLEASE RESPOND TO ALL THE QUESTIONS USING THE FOLLOWING SCALE:
1 = Strongly Disagree; 2 = Disagree; 3 = Neutral; 4 = Agree; 5 = Strongly Agree

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Corruptio</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Impunity within pertinent law enforcement agencies promotes a lack of accountability among enforcement officers which enables human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bribery of officials at the borders promotes human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vested interests among high ranking officials facilitate trafficking circuits in the country</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corruption undermines efforts to combat human trafficking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
and leaves victims terrified, unable to seek assistance from law enforcement or other state institutions

### Technology

Users of social networking sites (SNS) disclose information about themselves, knowingly or unknowingly which is instrumental in the recruitment and exploitation of trafficked persons

Due to technical advances, such as location tracking, and the openness of many SNS, it is possible for traffickers to gain a wide pool of data on trafficked persons

Access to adult entertainment sites, online dating sites, peer to peer networks promote human trafficking for sexual exploitation

### Human Resource Capacity

Inadequate allocation of resources for better enforcement, awareness, and victim services enable the continuity of human trafficking

Lack of training of police, government officials and service providers weakness enforcement capacity

Law enforcement agencies in the country do not have protocols to investigate human trafficking cases

1. In your experience, how has corruption contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate

1. In your experience, how has technology contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate

1. In your experience, how has human resource capacity contributed to human trafficking through the Kenya-Somalia border? Please elaborate
A3.2 Interview Guide

1. To what extent do you think human trafficking is present at the Kenya-Somalia Border?

2. Who are the victims of domestic human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border?

3. What are the main factors contributing to domestic human trafficking at the Kenya-Somalia border?

4. In your experience, what are some of the socio-economic factors perpetuating human trafficking across the Kenya-Somalia border?

5. What are the challenges faced in preventing and combating Human Trafficking in Kenya?

6. What recommendations would you give with regard to addressing human trafficking in Kenya?
7. Mention the available policies that handle migration in the country as applied in the county.

8. How effective have these policies been in curbing human trafficking in the country?
A3.3 Observation Guide

1. Any visible refugee camps

2. How many individuals there?

3. How many have identification items with them i.e. national identity cards or passport or travel document

4. Do the individuals in the camp act as if they are coached or under instruction from someone else?

5. Do the individuals have freedom of movement?

6. Any of them physically or emotionally harmed or deprived food, water, sleep or medical care and any other basic necessities?

7. Any documented policies that govern on human trafficking and migration in the county administrative offices?